

# EXHIBIT A

**Adams, Kashia**

---

**From:** Joseph Cammarata, Esq. <Joe@CammarataLawPC.com>  
**Sent:** Sunday, December 8, 2024 4:25 PM  
**To:** Nathan, Aaron E; Houghton-Larsen, M Annie  
**Cc:** Governski, Meryl Conant; Governski, Meryl Conant  
**Subject:** RE: Freeman v. Giuliani - Initial Disclosures  
**Attachments:** Final Defendants response to demands v1 DEC 8 final.pdf

\*\*\* EXTERNAL EMAIL \*\*\*

Please see the attached response to Plaintiff's demands.

Regards,

Joseph Cammarata Esq.  
Cammarata Law P.C.  
456 Arlene Street  
Staten Island, NY 10314  
Phone: 718-477-0020  
Fax: 718-494-3288

Admitted to Practice in:  
New York, New Jersey & Florida

[www.CammarataLawPC.com](http://www.CammarataLawPC.com)

**CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE:** This email and the documents accompanying it contain information which is confidential and/or legally privileged. The information is intended only for the use of the individual or entity addressed on this email.

If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any reliance on the contents of this information is strictly prohibited, and that the documents should be returned to this firm immediately. In this regard, if you have received this email in error, please notify us by email [at Joe@CammarataLawPC.com](mailto:Joe@CammarataLawPC.com) immediately so that we can arrange the return of the documents.

**IRS Circular 230 Disclosure:** As required by U.S. Treasury Regulations, we advise you that any tax advice contained in this communication (including any attachments) is not intended to be used for, and cannot be used for, the purpose of avoiding penalties under the United States federal tax laws.

**From:** Nathan, Aaron E. <ANathan@willkie.com>  
**Sent:** Friday, December 6, 2024 4:12 PM  
**To:** Joseph Cammarata, Esq. <Joe@CammarataLawPC.com>; Houghton-Larsen, M Annie <MHoughton-Larsen@willkie.com>  
**Cc:** Governski, Meryl Conant <MGovernski@willkie.com>; Governski, Meryl Conant <MGovernski@willkie.com>  
**Subject:** RE: Freeman v. Giuliani - Initial Disclosures

Joe, I will respond to this message shortly. For any communications between now and tomorrow evening, please make sure you continue to copy Ms. Governski and Ms. Houghton-Larsen; otherwise, my team will not see your messages.

**Aaron E. Nathan**  
**Willkie Farr & Gallagher LLP**  
787 Seventh Avenue | New York, NY 10019-6099  
Direct: [+1 212 728 8904](tel:+12127288904) | Fax: +1 212 728 8111  
[anathan@willkie.com](mailto:anathan@willkie.com) | [vCard](#) | [www.willkie.com bio](http://www.willkie.com/bio)

**From:** Joseph Cammarata, Esq. <[Joe@CammarataLawPC.com](mailto:Joe@CammarataLawPC.com)>  
**Sent:** Friday, December 6, 2024 4:03 PM  
**To:** Houghton-Larsen, M Annie <[MHoughton-Larsen@willkie.com](mailto:MHoughton-Larsen@willkie.com)>; Nathan, Aaron E. <[ANathan@willkie.com](mailto:ANathan@willkie.com)>  
**Cc:** Governski, Meryl Conant <[MGovernski@willkie.com](mailto:MGovernski@willkie.com)>; Governski, Meryl Conant <[MGovernski@willkie.com](mailto:MGovernski@willkie.com)>  
**Subject:** RE: Freeman v. Giuliani - Initial Disclosures

\*\*\* EXTERNAL EMAIL \*\*\*

Mr. Nathan,  
I will have the inventory segregation, supplemented responses to interrogatories and responses to the first and second request for productions as well shortly, which have voluminous document production that will be transmitted I have been working on this all day. Would you be amenable to an extension of time until 5 pm on Sunday in lieu of the previous 5 pm deadline for today. I am working diligently to get everything to you this weekend. It is likely I will have the inventory to you today. As you know I am solely handling this, Thank you in advance for the consideration of a courtesy extension.

Regards,

Joseph Cammarata Esq.  
Cammarata Law P.C.  
456 Arlene Street  
Staten Island, NY 10314  
Phone: 718-477-0020  
Fax: 718-494-3288

Admitted to Practice in:  
New York, New Jersey & Florida

[www.CammarataLawPC.com](http://www.CammarataLawPC.com)

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This email and the documents accompanying it contain information which is confidential and/or legally privileged. The information is intended only for the use of the individual or entity addressed on this email.

If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any reliance on the contents of this information is strictly prohibited, and that the documents should be returned to this firm immediately. In this regard, if you have received this email in error, please notify us by email [at Joe@CammarataLawPC.com](mailto:Joe@CammarataLawPC.com) immediately so that we can arrange the return of the documents.

*IRS Circular 230 Disclosure:* As required by U.S. Treasury Regulations, we advise you that any tax advice contained in this communication (including any attachments) is not intended to be used for, and cannot be used for, the purpose of avoiding penalties under the United States federal tax laws.

---

**From:** Houghton-Larsen, M Annie <[MHoughton-Larsen@willkie.com](mailto:MHoughton-Larsen@willkie.com)>

**Sent:** Wednesday, December 4, 2024 10:05 AM

**To:** Joseph Cammarata, Esq. <[Joe@CammarataLawPC.com](mailto:Joe@CammarataLawPC.com)>; Nathan, Aaron E. <[ANathan@willkie.com](mailto:ANathan@willkie.com)>

**Cc:** Governski, Meryl Conant <[MGovernski@willkie.com](mailto:MGovernski@willkie.com)>; Governski, Meryl Conant <[MGovernski@willkie.com](mailto:MGovernski@willkie.com)>

**Subject:** RE: Freeman v. Giuliani - Initial Disclosures

Joe,

We consent to your request to serve supplemented responses to Plaintiffs' first set of interrogatories by Friday December 6 at 5 p.m.

However, we reiterate our request that you confirm the accuracy of Mr. Giuliani's initial disclosures or provide updated disclosures by no later than this Friday December 6 at 12 p.m.

Thank you,

**M.Annie Houghton-Larsen**

**Willkie Farr & Gallagher LLP**

787 Seventh Avenue | New York, NY 10019-6099

Direct: [+1 212 728 8164](tel:+12127288164) | Fax: +1 212 728 9164

[mhoughton-larsen@willkie.com](mailto:mhoughton-larsen@willkie.com) | [vCard](#) | [www.willkie.com/bio](http://www.willkie.com/bio)

Pronouns: she, her, hers

---

**From:** Joseph Cammarata, Esq. <[Joe@CammarataLawPC.com](mailto:Joe@CammarataLawPC.com)>

**Sent:** Wednesday, December 4, 2024 9:12 AM

**To:** Nathan, Aaron E. <[ANathan@willkie.com](mailto:ANathan@willkie.com)>

**Cc:** Governski, Meryl Conant <[MGovernski@willkie.com](mailto:MGovernski@willkie.com)>; Houghton-Larsen, M Annie <[MHoughton-Larsen@willkie.com](mailto:MHoughton-Larsen@willkie.com)>; Governski, Meryl Conant <[MGovernski@willkie.com](mailto:MGovernski@willkie.com)>; Houghton-Larsen, M Annie <[MHoughton-Larsen@willkie.com](mailto:MHoughton-Larsen@willkie.com)>

**Subject:** Re: Freeman v. Giuliani - Initial Disclosures

\*\*\* EXTERNAL EMAIL \*\*\*

I am requesting an extension of time today to get the supplemented responses until Friday December 6, 2024 at 5 pm.

Regards,

Joseph Cammarata, Esq.  
Cammarata & De Meyer P.C.  
456 Arlene Street  
Staten Island, NY 10314  
Phone: 718-477-0020  
Fax: 718-494-3288

Admitted to Practice in:  
New York, New Jersey & Florida

[www.CDLawPC.com](http://www.CDLawPC.com)

**CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE:** This email and the documents accompanying it contain information which is confidential and/or legally privileged. The information is intended only for the use of the individual or entity addressed on this email.

If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any reliance on the contents of this information is strictly prohibited, and that the documents should be returned to this firm immediately. In this regard, if you have received this email in error, please notify us by email at [Joe@CDLawPC.com](mailto:Joe@CDLawPC.com) immediately so that we can arrange the return of the documents.

*IRS Circular 230 Disclosure:* As required by U.S. Treasury Regulations, we advise you that any tax advice contained in this communication (including any attachments) is not intended to be used for, and cannot be used for, the purpose of avoiding penalties under the United States federal tax laws.

On Dec 3, 2024, at 11:47 AM, Nathan, Aaron E. <[ANathan@willkie.com](mailto:ANathan@willkie.com)> wrote:

Joe,

Further to the below email, Defendant's untimely responses to Plaintiffs' First Set of Interrogatories are facially deficient and require supplementation. Please complete your responses to these interrogatories **by no later than 5pm tomorrow, December 4, 2024**. Below, we identify only those deficiencies that we believe are critical to Plaintiffs' efforts at this time, not all of the deficiencies. Plaintiffs reserve the right to supplement our request at a later date.

1. With respect to Interrogatory #3, the interrogatory asks Defendant to identify "all" documents he intends to rely on to support his homestead contention, but the response is "not limited to" the listed documents and "reserves the right to submit and use" "other documents" that are not

disclosed in the interrogatory response. Defendant is required to supplement this response accordingly.

2. With respect to Interrogatory #4, Defendant's objection is waived because it is untimely. Fed. R. Civ. P. 33(b)(4). Further, Defendant's objection is meritless because the interrogatory seeks the identities of "any financial, medical, or legal professional or firm" that Defendant consulted within the relevant period and that information is not protected from disclosure by any privilege. Moreover, Defendant has waived any such privilege by disclosing the identities of attorneys he has consulted in his response to Interrogatory #5. Defendant is required to supplement this response accordingly.
3. With respect to Interrogatory #8, Defendant's objection is waived because it is untimely. Fed. R. Civ. P. 33(b)(4). Further, Defendant's objection is meritless because the stated objection does not constitute a valid basis to withhold responsive information. Defendant is required to supplement this response accordingly.
4. With respect to Interrogatory #9, Defendant's response does not include the requested "detail" and therefore is facially deficient. Defendant is required to supplement this response accordingly.

Thank you,  
Aaron

**Aaron E. Nathan**  
**Willkie Farr & Gallagher LLP**  
787 Seventh Avenue | New York, NY 10019-6099  
Direct: [+1 212 728 8904](tel:+12127288904) | Fax: +1 212 728 8111  
[anathan@willkie.com](mailto:anathan@willkie.com) | [vCard](#) | [www.willkie.com bio](http://www.willkie.com/bio)

---

**From:** Houghton-Larsen, M Annie <[MHoughton-Larsen@willkie.com](mailto:MHoughton-Larsen@willkie.com)>  
**Sent:** Monday, December 2, 2024 6:38 PM  
**To:** Joseph Cammarata, Esq. <[Joe@CammarataLawPC.com](mailto:Joe@CammarataLawPC.com)>  
**Cc:** Nathan, Aaron E. <[ANathan@willkie.com](mailto:ANathan@willkie.com)>; Governski, Meryl Conant <[MGovernski@willkie.com](mailto:MGovernski@willkie.com)>  
**Subject:** Freeman v. Giuliani - Initial Disclosures

Joe,

Thank you for providing Mr. Giuliani's responses to Plaintiffs first set of interrogatory responses. We are continuing to review the responses and expect that we will be following up regarding the deficiency of many of them.

In the interim, we wanted to confirm that Mr. Giuliani's initial disclosures, which I am attaching here for your convenience, remain accurate. Specifically, the disclosure that the only witness he intends to rely on is himself in light of the responses to interrogatory requests 1, 2, 5, and 6. We ask that you confirm the accuracy of Mr. Giuliani's initial disclosures or provide updated disclosures by no later than this Friday December 6 at 12 p.m.

Thank you,  
Annie

**M.Annie Houghton-Larsen**  
**Willkie Farr & Gallagher LLP**

787 Seventh Avenue | New York, NY 10019-6099

Direct: [+1 212 728 8164](tel:+12127288164) | Fax: +1 212 728 9164

[mhoughton-larsen@willkie.com](mailto:mhoughton-larsen@willkie.com) | [vCard](#) | [www.willkie.com bio](http://www.willkie.com/bio)

Pronouns: she, her, hers

---

**Important Notice:** This email message is intended to be received only by persons entitled to receive the confidential information it may contain. Email messages to clients of Willkie Farr & Gallagher LLP presumptively contain information that is confidential and legally privileged; email messages to non-clients are normally confidential and may also be legally privileged. Please do not read, copy, forward or store this message unless you are an intended recipient of it. If you have received this message in error, please forward it back. Willkie Farr & Gallagher LLP is a limited liability partnership organized in the United States under the laws of the State of Delaware, which laws limit the personal liability of partners.

---

**Important Notice:** This email message is intended to be received only by persons entitled to receive the confidential information it may contain. Email messages to clients of Willkie Farr & Gallagher LLP presumptively contain information that is confidential and legally privileged; email messages to non-clients are normally confidential and may also be legally privileged. Please do not read, copy, forward or store this message unless you are an intended recipient of it. If you have received this message in error, please forward it back. Willkie Farr & Gallagher LLP is a limited liability partnership organized in the United States under the laws of the State of Delaware, which laws limit the personal liability of partners.

---

**Important Notice:** This email message is intended to be received only by persons entitled to receive the confidential information it may contain. Email messages to clients of Willkie Farr & Gallagher LLP presumptively contain information that is confidential and legally privileged; email messages to non-clients are normally confidential and may also be legally privileged. Please do not read, copy, forward or store this message unless you are an intended recipient of it. If you have received this message in error, please forward it back. Willkie Farr & Gallagher LLP is a limited liability partnership organized in the United States under the laws of the State of Delaware, which laws limit the personal liability of partners.